



**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Monday, January 27, 2014 – 7:00 P.M.**

1. **CALL TO ORDER** Chair Charles called the meeting to order at 7:00pm.

2. **ROLL CALL**
Present: Chair Charles, Vice-Chair Castro, Rice, Charlie, Levin, and Torgan

Absent: Commissioner Ostergren

STAFF PRESENT: Emily Stadnicki, HPC Liaison/Senior Planner; Antonio Castillo, Associate Planner and Sharita Ellies, Commission Secretary

3. **APPROVAL OF AGENDA:**
The Historic Preservation Commission is requested to approve the Agenda.
Recommendation: Approve the agenda of Monday, January 27, 2014 as presented. **Moved by Commissioner Levin, seconded by Commissioner Torgan and unanimously carried; noting the absence of Commissioner Ostergren.**

4. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**
The Historic Preservation Commission is requested to approve the minutes of prior Historic Preservation Commission meetings.
Recommendation: Approve the meeting minutes of, November 25, 2013 as amended. **Moved by Commissioner Levin seconded by Commissioner Torgan and noting the absence of Commissioner Ostergren.**

VICE-CHAIR CASTRO requested the following correction:

Page 6; Line 12:

~~COMMISSIONER CASTRO~~ **UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER:** It's happened in other commissions, just so you know. There's a glitch somehow, but it's hard to find it.

5. **Public Comment:**

STEPHANIE HARKER, RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD, CO-FOUNDER OF WEST HOLLYWOOD PRESERVATION ALLIANCE AND CO-FOUNDER OF PROTECT PLUMMER PARK, spoke regarding the recommendation by City Council to relocate the historic Great Hall/Long Hall building to create open space within the park.

She requested that the HPC support their request to retain this National Monument within the City of West Hollywood.

CATHY BLAIVAS, RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD, spoke about protecting Plummer Park's Historic Great Hall/Long Hall. She said the reprieve to demolish Great Hall/Long Hall appears to be temporary and requested the Commission's support towards preserving the buildings.

She said the members of Protect Plummer Park and the members of the community are in favor of restoring and repurposing the buildings and ended her comments by stating other alternatives to creating open, recreational space within the City.

ROB BERGSTEIN, RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD spoke regarding the code for preserving historic trees. He requested that the Commission, at the suggestion of Staff, review and/or revise the code to better preserve historic trees that are not visible to the public.

6. **CONSENT CALENDAR:** None.

7. **EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR:** None.

8. **COMMISSION CONSIDERATION:** None.

9. **PUBLIC HEARINGS:**

- A. **1330 N. HARPER AVENUE (El Pasadero):** The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) and Rehabilitation Incentives (RI) to rehabilitate a 15-unit multi-family building designated as a cultural resource. The Rehabilitation Incentive requested is a change in use from residential apartments to a Bed and Breakfast Inn and a Mills Act Contract in exchange for rehabilitation and ongoing maintenance of the cultural resource.

COMMISSIONER LEVIN recused himself from discussion of Item 9.A.

STAFF ANTONIO CASTILLO provided a PowerPoint presentation detailing information as listed in the Staff Report.

He stated the location of the site, the process and purpose of the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) and Rehabilitation Incentives (RI) to change the use from an apartment building to an Inn as well as the request for the Mills Act contract for ongoing maintenance of the cultural resource.

He listed the properties present deteriorated condition and its existing features. He said it's listed as a contributing building in both the Harper Avenue Historic and the Courtyard Thematic Districts.

He said the historic building has fallen into a state of disrepair due to age and poor or inappropriate maintenance practices. He said it is in need of costly and extensive interior and exterior renovations. He said the

structure will require ongoing maintenance to preserve its character defining features and said the applicant is also proposing to rehabilitate and restore the building through a series of restorations in accordance with the *Secretary of Interior's Standards*.

In addition to the rehabilitation, the applicant requests to convert the building into a 14-unit Bed and Breakfast Inn and one unit will be for housing the resident manager/concierge.

He said Staff supports the proposed project given that the proposed work would help preserve the building's significant architectural features; the savings provided by a Mills Act Contract would provide resources for the preservation, rehabilitation, and maintenance of the property and site; the proposed work to the cultural resource would not adversely impact the property's historic character; the proposed work would be subject to conformance to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and the change of use to a 14-unit Bed and Breakfast Inn is compatible with the residential uses within the neighborhood and the Harper Avenue Historic District.

He noted for the record an error within the Draft Resolution under Condition 1.1. and said it has been corrected.

Item 9.A. Applicant Presentation:

ALLEGRA ALLISON/APPLICANT REPRESENTATIVE, RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD spoke in favor of Staff recommendation. She said the goal of the Applicant, Jerome Nash, is to rehabilitate, restore and maintain the historic building; there will be no demolition, no additional construction or repair that will obstruct its character defining features.

She said, the proposed work will enhance the neighborhood and said repairs to the interior structure will comply with the *Secretary of Interior Standards*.

She said the alternative of not improving the project will leave the building in its present state of disrepair and the owner will not be able to rent out the apartments for a minimum of five to ten years and concluded her comments by requesting the support of the HPC.

Item 9.A. Public Comment:

LYNDIA LOWY, OFFICER OF WEST HOLLYWOOD PRESERVATION ALLIANCE/RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation to preserve the building but said the Preservation Alliance does not support converting the apartment building into a Bed and Breakfast Inn, which will potentially become a non-residential use. She said their goals are commendable but the Alliance cannot unequivocally support the project as it appears.

LYNN RUSSELL, RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation to grant the Mills Act Contract. She commented regarding the economic hardship noted by the owner, the present and potential marketable rate of each unit and said there was no legitimate financial documentation to support the owner's alleged financial hardship.

She said she does not support the recommendation to allow the change of use from apartment building into a Bed and Breakfast Inn and said the building can be renovated and potentially be designated as a local landmark by granting the Mills Act Contract.

VICTOR OMELCZENKO, RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD expressed concerns regarding staff's recommendation. He said he agreed with comments by Lynn Russell and said there's presently an analysis by City consultants reviewing the existing 46 historic landmarks to address incentives to help owners maintain designated resources and suggested that the item be revisited at a later date to allow time for the findings by the consultants.

He expressed concerns regarding neighborhood compatibility and the present condition of the building's disrepair and said residential code compliance should have been involved to possibly prevent this situation.

He said the building has been included in the Historic District, the North Harper District and recognized by the City, State and Federal Government and said there should a better system in place to maintain these historic structures.

ALLEGRA ALLISON/APPLICANT REPRESENTATIVE, RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD commented regarding the units market rates. She said the building is Ellised and none of the units will be eligible to go back to market rate; if not approved the building will not be rented for a minimum of five-years.

She said the definition of Bed and Breakfast Inn is required based on the number of existing units; thirty-units and under is considered a Bed and Breakfast; over thirty-units is an Urban Inn.

Item 9.A. Public Comment Closed

Item 9.A. Commissioners Comments

COMMISSIONER TORGAN spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He disclosed that he met with the Applicant. He addressed the issues of economic hardship and the two-year period of non-tenancy during renovations.

He spoke about interior and exterior expenditures which could be considerably higher and would not be economically feasible. He said historic Bed and Breakfasts can be an appropriate incentive. He explained the study mentioned by Mr. Omelczenko will not be completed for another year and would be too much of a delay to the owner.

He said the issue of neighborhood compatibility, as a potential result of traffic issues can be resolved by the proposed availability of parking within the structure.

VICE-CHAIR CASTRO spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He commended the Applicant for bringing the item before the Commission and said it fully takes advantage of the benefits of being a local cultural resource within the City. He said he, too, has concerns regarding the economic hardship. He said there are countless costs for repair of historic properties of this nature.

He stated he supports the items requested by the Applicant and said potential negative impacts will be resolved by the number of available parking spaces, events and food services will be minimal.

COMMISSIONER RICE spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He also disclosed that he toured the building and also supports the idea of Adaptive Reuse. He said the success of the Charlie is an example of how this item will work well within its neighborhood.

COMMISSIONER CHARLIE spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He said he supports rehabilitation of historic structures and said he, too, agrees the proposed cost to repair is inaccurate and should be revisited.

He said there will be a significant amount of time before the owner sees a return from the Bed and Breakfast but will be beneficial to the look of the neighborhood and is a very creative use.

CHAIR CHARLES spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He addressed the long term implication of Ellisling tenants and the issue of aging housing stock. He said the alternative, to deny the project, would not be beneficial to the building and its owner.

He said the number of Bed and Breakfasts within the City is beneficial but requires a broader look at the impact to the City in the future.

COMMISSIONER TORGAN moved to approve RESOLUTION NO. HPC 14-109 as amended by Staff:

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD, APPROVING A REHABILITATION INCENTIVE IN THE FORM OF A CHANGE IN USE FROM RESIDENTIAL APARTMENTS TO A BED AND BREAKFAST INN,

LOCATED AT 1330 NORTH HARPER AVENUE, WEST HOLLYWOOD,
CALIFORNIA

Action: Recommend approval of a Rehabilitation Incentive in the form of a change in use from residential apartments to a Bed and Breakfast Inn, located at 1330 North Harper Avenue to the City Council as amended, **moved by Commissioner Torgan, seconded by Vice-Chair Castro and passes on roll call vote:**

Ayes: Charlie, Rice, Torgan, Castro and Charles
Noes: None
Recuse: Levin
Absent: Ostergren

- B. 1041 N. FORMOSA AVENUE (THE LOT):** The applicant is proposing changes to the 2007 Revised Comprehensive Development Plan (CDP). This meeting is an opportunity for the Commission to comment on the proposed Addendum to the Final Supplemental Impact Report (Final EIR) prepared for the 2007 Revised CDP. The proposed revisions will reduce the overall square footage and retain the existing historic buildings along Santa Monica Boulevard and Formosa Avenue.

STAFF EMILY STADNICKI provided a PowerPoint presentation detailing information as listed in the Staff Report.

She stated the location of the site and said The Lot is proposing to amend their Comprehensive Development Plan (originally approved in 1993 and last amended in 2007) to reduce total square footage by approximately 103,000 square feet. This reduces overall FAR from 1.63 to 1.38. In addition, Rather than removing buildings along Santa Monica Boulevard and Formosa, all the primary historic structures will remain. Also the shifting of the Plaza Building to the south helps to preserve the character along Santa Monica Boulevard.

She addressed 4 potential impacts related to the proposed changes: historic resources, aesthetics, traffic, and air quality.

She said the only significant unavoidable adverse impact identified in the Final Supplemental EIR was the impact on historic resources due to the demolition of primary historic structures. The new project maintains these primary historic resources and eliminates this issue; the Commissary is the only historic structure not being retained in the revised CDP and its removal was previously analyzed in the Final EIR.

She said the revised CDP is consistent with the building height zones defined in the 2007 CDP and places the new FAR in generally the same locations as before.

She explained proposed project revisions would not result in new significant air quality impacts. She said the meeting is intended to receive comments on the addendum only and will be forwarded the Planning Commission who will make a recommendation to the City Council on the Addendum and the proposed Amendment.

Item 9.B. Applicant Presentation:

BRADLY AARONSON/APPLICANT REPRESENTATIVE, RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He said the proposal to revive the CDP will allow CIM and The Lot to move forward progressively for the City of West Hollywood and the entertainment industry that will also stay true to and maintain the history of the site which is one of the oldest studios in Los Angeles and West Hollywood.

He said the five historic properties within The Lot that were slated to be demolished will be retained and any new proposed development will be completed on current open spaces within The Lot and would maintain the properties on Santa Monica Boulevard and Formosa Avenue which currently maintains 5 of the primary contributing buildings.

VICE-CHAIR CASTRO asked how Mr. Aaronson represents the project and if he is with CIM.

BRADLEY AARONSON said he's one of the project managers, has been with the project since 2007 and said yes, he is with CIM.

Item 9.B. Public Comment:

ROB BERGSTEIN, RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD expressed some concern's regarding Staff's recommendation. He said the property owner, at the time he served on the Eastside PAC promised to maintain the properties along the Santa Monica Blvd. side of the building and requested that the new owner be held to the same agreement.

VICTOR OMELCZENKO, RESIDENT OF THE CITY OF WEST HOLLYWOOD expressed concerns regarding staff's recommendation. He gave a brief history of The Lot dating back to 1916; Jesse Hampton Studios. He said he was involved with, and commented on, the EIR in 2007 when the buildings were originally slated for demolition and is very happy that the project is being reviewed again. He said the buildings are the only remaining representative of their type within the confines of West Hollywood and therefore they should be preserved on the basis of their posterity.

He asked if the Commission is concerned about historic buildings within The Lot and will they be saved as well. He asked for clarification of the

statement of overriding consideration in 2007 and said he was happy to see that the buildings in question today will be preserved.

Item 9.B. Public Comment Closed

Item 9.B. Commissioner Comments:

COMMISSIONER LEVIN disclosed that he met with the Applicant Representative but did not discuss anything relating to the staff report.

COMMISSIONER TORGAN also disclosed that he met with the Applicant Representative but did not discuss anything relating to the staff report.

COMMISSIONER LEVIN spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He stated he served on the Commission in 2007 when the EIR was first presented. He said the revised plan is a staggering improvement and he does not have concerns regarding the existing Sinatra Bungalow or other buildings within the site.

He said his primary concern was those things most accessible to the public which are the buildings along Formosa Avenue. He explained there was also proposal in 2007 to remove a large wall to allow for a more visual connection to the interior which was also removed from this revised plan.

He also advised Speaker, Victor Omelczenko that overriding considerations are at the discretion of City Council, not the HPC.

VICE-CHAIR CASTRO spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He said he, too, served on the Commission in 2007 and is also delighted with the revisions to the proposed plan.

He stated he has no issues with the addendum to the EIR regarding the project moving forward.

COMMISSIONER TORGAN spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He said although the reduced FAR is not within the Commission's purview for discussion, its benefits to the eastside are highly appreciated.

He suggested that the original 1993 plan be reviewed for more details regarding rehabilitation issues.

COMMISSIONER CHARLIE spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He agreed with previous comments by Commissioner Torgan and supports the revised plan.

COMMISSIONER RICE spoke in favor of Staff's recommendation. He asked if historic elements of the building will be saved and/or does the Applicant plan to refurbish any of the existing elements.

BRADLEY AARONSON/APPLICANT REPRESENTATIVE said the proposed rehabilitation to the buildings on Santa Monica Boulevard is a phase contemplated in the existing CDP; that phasing wouldn't change as part of this revision.

Action: Receive Commissioners' comments on impacts to historic resources for inclusion in the staff report to the Planning Commission.

10. **NEW BUSINESS:** None.

11. **UNFINISHED BUSINESS:** None.

12. **ITEMS FROM STAFF:**

HPC LIAISON EMILY STADNICKI said there are no new projects but discussed the Multi-Family Incentives. She said Staff toured eleven properties with the consultant group and will be revisiting four of them with a structural engineer and cost estimator to get a more in depth picture of the types of costs associated with rehabilitation.

13. **HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:**

COMMISSIONER LEVIN said he participated in a walkthrough of his building, 1309 N. Harper, with representatives of the consultant team for the preliminary survey of the historic properties. He's also attended a few joint sub-committee meetings as well.

COMMISSIONER CHARLIE spoke about the need for and status of the social media project discussed in previous meetings.

14. **PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

ADJOURNMENT: *The Historic Preservation Commission adjourned at 8:09 pm to a regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission on Monday, February 24, 2014, 7:00 P.M. at Plummer Park – 7377 Santa Monica Boulevard, West Hollywood, California.*

APPROVED BY A MOTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON THIS 24th DAY OF MARCH 2014.



CHAIR CRAIG CHARLES

ATTEST:



HPC STAFF LIAISON EMILY STADNICKI